# IN THE COURT OF COMMON PLEAS FRANKLIN COUNTY, OHIO

STATE OF OHIO ex rel.,	) CASE NO.: 17CV011207
ATTORNEY GENERAL	)
MICHAEL DEWINE	) JUDGE REECE
Plaintiff,	) ) AGREED ENTRY AND ) FINAL JUDGMENT ORDER
VS.	RECEIVED
BOEHRINGER INGELHEIM PHARMACEUTICALS, INC.	) ATTORNEY GENERAL OF OHIO
Defendant.	JAN <b>0 2</b> 2018
	CONSUMER PROTECTION SECTION PUBLIC INSPECTION FILE

Plaintiff has filed a Complaint for a permanent injunction and other relief in this matter pursuant to R.C. 1345.07, and Plaintiff, by its counsel, Attorney General Michael DeWine, and Defendant Boehringer Ingelheim Pharmaceuticals, Inc. (BIPI), by its counsel, have agreed to the entry of this Agreed Entry and Final Judgment Order (Order) by the Court without trial or adjudication of any issue of fact or law, and without finding or admission of wrongdoing or liability of any kind.

# IT IS HEREBY ORDERED THAT:

## 1. PARTIES

- 1.1 Plaintiff, State of Ohio, is charged with the enforcement of the Ohio Consumer Sales Practices Act, R.C. 1345.01 et seq.
- 1.2 Defendant, Boehringer Ingelheim Pharmaceuticals, Inc., is a Delaware corporation with its principal place of business at 900 Ridgebury Road in Ridgefield, Connecticut. At all relevant times, BIPI did business in Ohio by marketing, selling, and

Promoting the drugs Aggrenox, Atrovent, Combivent, and Micardis (hereinafter the "Covered Products").

#### 2. PREAMBLE

- 2.1 Prior to the execution of this Order, BIPI represents it voluntarily established a compliance program that is applicable to all BIPI employees.
- 2.2 BIPI further represents its compliance program includes a Compliance Officer; a Code of Conduct; written policies and procedures; education and training initiatives; a disclosure program that allows for confidential disclosure and investigation of potential compliance violations and appropriate disciplinary procedures; and regular internal auditing procedures.

## 3. FINDINGS

- 3.1 This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter of this lawsuit and over all parties.
  - 3.2 The terms of this Order shall be governed by the laws of the State of Ohio.
- 3.3 Entry of this Order is in the public interest and reflects a negotiated agreement among the parties.
- 3.4 The parties have agreed to resolve the issues resulting from the Covered Conduct by entering into this Order.
- 3.5 BIPI is willing to enter into this Order regarding the Covered Concluct in order to resolve the Signatory Attorney General's concerns under the State Consumer Protection Laws as to the matters addressed in this Order and thereby avoid significant expense, inconvenience, and uncertainty.
- 3.6 BIPI is entering into this Order solely for the purpose of settlement, and nothing contained herein may be taken as or construed to be an admission or concession of any violation of law, or regulation, or of any other matter of fact or law, or of any liability or wrongdoing,

including allegations in the Complaint, all of which BIPI expressly denies. BIPI does not admit any violation of law, and does not admit any wrongdoing that was or could have been alleged by the Signatory Attorney General before the date of the Order. No part of this Order, including its statements and commitments, shall constitute evidence of any liability, fault, or wrongdoing by BIPI.

- 3.7 This Order shall not be construed or used as a waiver or limitation of any defense otherwise available to BIPI in any action, or of BIPI's right to defend itself from, or make any arguments in, any private individual, regulatory, governmental, or class claims or suits relating to the subject matter or terms of this Order. Nothing in this Order shall waive, release, or otherwise affect any claims, defenses, or positions BIPI may have in connection with any investigations, claims, or other matters the State is not releasing hereunder. This Order is made without trial or adjudication of any issue of fact or law or finding of liability of any kind. It is the intent of the parties that this Order shall not be binding or admissible in any other matter, including, but not limited to, any investigation or litigation, other than in connection with the enforcement of this Order. Unless otherwise provided under state law, no part of this Order shall create a private cause of action or confer any right to any third party for violation of any federal or state statute except that a State may file an action to enforce the terms of this Order. Notwithstanding the foregoing, Ohio may file an action to enforce the terms of this Order.
- 3.8 This Order (or any portion thereof) shall in no way be construed to prohibit, limit, or restrict BIPI from making representations with respect to the Covered Products that are permitted or authorized under federal law, the Federal Food, Drug & Cosmetic Act ("FDCA"), 21 U.S.C. § 301 et seq., U.S. Food and Drug Administration ("FDA") regulations, or FDA Guidances for Industry, currently issued or as revised. Further, the Order shall in no way

prohibit, limit, or restrict BIPI from making representations with respect to the Covered Products that are required or authorized by, or consistent with the FDA-approved Labeling or prescribing information, or by any Investigational New Drug Application, New Drug Application, Supplemental New Drug Application, or Abbreviated New Drug Application filed with the FDA so long as the representation, taken in its entirety, is not false, misleading or deceptive.

- 3.9 Nothing in this Order shall require BIPI to:
  - (a) take any action that is prohibited by the Food, Drug and Cosmetic Act, 21

    U.S.C. § 301 et seq. ("FDCA") or any regulation promulgated thereunder, or

    by the FDA; or
  - (b) fail to take any action that is required by the FDCA or any regulation promulgated thereunder, or by the FDA.

#### 4. **DEFINITIONS**

The following definitions shall be used in construing this Order:

- 4.1 "BIPI" means Boehringer Ingelheim Pharmaceuticals, Inc., including all of its past and present subsidiaries, predecessors, successors, and assigns.
- 4.2 "BIPI Marketing" shall mean BIPI personnel responsible for marketing Covered Products in the United States.
- 4.3 "BIPI Medical" shall mean BIPI personnel who are highly trained experts with specialized scientific or medical knowledge whose roles involve the provision of specialized medical or scientific information, scientific analysis, and/or scientific information to HCPs but excludes anyone performing sales, marketing, or other commercial roles.
- 4.4 "BIPI Sales" shall mean the BIPI sales force responsible for sales of Covered Products in the United States, including, but not limited to, the field force and all management

personnel such as district managers, regional managers, vice president(s) over sales, and president over sales.

- 4.5 "Clear(ly) and Conspicuous(ly)" shall mean, with respect to a disclosure or information presented, that such information meets requirements of the FDCA, the requirements of FDA regulations, and the recommended actions in FDA Guidances for Industry, including FDA's "Guidance for Industry: Presenting Risk Information in Prescription Drug and Medical Device Promotion," or as revised.
- 4.6 "Covered Conduct" shall mean BIPI's Promotional and marketing practices, and dissemination of information and remuneration to HCPs regarding the Covered Products through the Effective Date of the Order.
- 4.7 "Covered Product" shall mean BIPI drugs: Aggrenox, Atrovent, Combivent, and Micardis, which have all been approved by FDA.
- 4.8 "Effective Date" shall mean the date on which a copy of this Order, duly executed by BIPI and by the Signatory Attorney General, is approved by, and becomes an Order of the Court.
- 4.9 "FDA Guidances for Industry" shall mean documents, as currently drafted or as revised, issued by the FDA pursuant to 21 U.S.C. §371(h) that represent the FDA's current thinking on a topic.
- 4.10 "HCP" shall mean any physician or other health care practitioner, who is licensed to provide health care services or to prescribe pharmaceutical products.
- 4.11 "Labeling" shall mean all labels and other written, printed, or graphic matter (a) upon any article or any of its containers or wrappers, or (b) accompanying such article.

- 4.12 "Medical Information Response(s)" shall mean a non-Promotional, scientific communication to address an Unsolicited Request for medical information from a HCP.
- 4.13 "Multistate Executive Committee" shall mean the Attorneys General and their staffs representing Arizona, the District of Columbia, Illinois, Indiana, Kansas, Nevada,
  Pennsylvania, Tennessee, and Texas.
- 4.14 "Multistate Working Group" shall mean the Attorneys General and their staffs representing Alabama, Alaska, Arizona, Arkansas, California, Colorado, Connecticut, Delaware, the District of Columbia, Florida, Georgia, Hawaii¹, Idaho, Illinois, Indiana, Iowa, Kansas, Kentucky, Louisiana, Maine, Maryland, Massachusetts, Michigan, Minnesota, Mississippi, Missouri, Montana, Nebraska, Nevada, New Hampshire, New Jersey, New Mexico, New York, North Carolina, North Dakota, Ohio, Oklahoma, Oregon, Pennsylvania, Rhode Island, South Carolina, South Dakota, Tennessee, Texas, Utah², Vermont, Virginia, Washington, West Virginia, Wisconsin, and Wyoming.
- 4.15 "Off-Label" shall mean a use, including indication, dosage, population, and/or method of administration, not consistent with the use approved by the FDA in the Labeling for a Covered Product at the time information regarding such use was communicated, or at the time the conduct occurred.
- 4.16 "Promotional," "Promoting," or "Promote" shall mean representations made to HCPs, patients, consumers, payors, and other customers, about a Covered Product and other

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Hawaii is being represented on this matter by its Office of Consumer Protection, an agency which is not part of the state Attorney General's Office, but which is statutorily authorized to undertake consumer protection functions, including legal representation of the State of Hawaii. For simplicity, the entire group will be referred to as the "Attorneys General," and such designation, as it includes Hawaii, refers to the Executive Director of the State of Hawaii Office of Consumer Protection.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The Utah Attorney General's Office represents the Utah Division of Consumer Protection (Division), the state agency charged with enforcement of the Consumer Sales Practices Act, in this action, but is not a party itself. As to Utah, the definition of "Attorneys General" means the Utah Attorney General as counsel to the Division.

practices intended to increase sales in the United States or that attempt to influence prescribing practices of HCPs in the United States, including direct-to-consumer.

- 4.17 "Promotional Materials" shall mean any item used to Promote a Covered Product.
- 4.18 "Promotional Speaker(s)" shall mean a HCP speaker engaged by or on behalf of BIPI to Promote a Covered Product in the United States.
- 4.19 "Reprints Containing Off-Label Information" shall mean articles or reprints from a scientific or medical journal, as defined in 21 C.F.R. 99.3(j), or reference publication, as defined in 21 C.F.R. 99.3(i), describing an Off-Label use of a Covered Product.
- 4.20 "Signatory Attorney General" shall mean the Attorney General of Ohio, or the Attorney General's authorized designee, who has agreed to this Judgment/Order.
- 4.21 "State Consumer Protection Laws" shall mean the Ohio Consumer Sales Practices Act, R.C. 1345.01 et seq.
- 4.22 "Unsolicited Request" shall mean a request for information communicated to an agent of BIPI that has not been prompted by or on behalf of BIPI.
- 4.23 Any reference to a written document shall mean a physical paper copy of the document, an electronic version of the document, or electronic access to such document.

#### 5. COMPLIANCE PROVISIONS

The following Compliance Provisions, Paragraphs 5.3 through 5.24, shall apply for five (5) years from the Effective Date of this Order.

## **Promotional Activities**

- 5.1 BIPI shall not make, or cause to be made, any written or oral claim that is false, misleading, or deceptive regarding any Covered Product.
- 5.2 BIPI shall not represent that any Covered Product has any sponsorship, approval, characteristics, ingredients, uses, benefits, quantities, or qualities that it does not have.

- 5.3 BIPI shall not promote any Covered Product for any Off-Label use.
- 5.4 In Promotional Materials for Covered Products, BIPI shall Clearly and Conspicuously disclose the risks associated with the Covered Products as set forth in the products' Labeling and shall present information about effectiveness and risk in a balanced manner.
- 5.5 BIPI shall require that all Promotional Speakers for any Covered Product comply with BIPI's obligations contained in this Order.
- 5.6 BIPI shall notify BIPI Sales promptly of any warning letter received from the FDA that affects the conduct of any sales representative in Promoting the relevant Covered Product and shall promptly disseminate a description of the concerns described in the warning letter.
- 5.7 BIPI shall not Promote a Covered Product by misrepresenting any clinical treatment guideline in a manner that suggests a Covered Product is approved for uses not consistent with the FDA-approved prescribing information.

## **Product Sampling**

- 5.8 BIPI shall provide samples of a Covered Product only to those HCPs whose clinical practice is consistent with the product's FDA-approved Labeling.
- 5.9 If a HCP whose clinical practice is inconsistent with a Covered Product's Labeling requests samples of that Covered Product, BIPI personnel shall refer the HCP to BIPI Medical where the HCP can speak directly with a BIPI Medical representative who will provide answers to the HCP's questions about the Covered Product, and BIPI may provide him/her with samples only if appropriate (i.e., if the HCP requests the samples for an FDA-approved [on-label] use).

#### Financial Incentives to BIPI Sales and/or BIPI Marketing

- 5.10 BIPI's financial incentives shall be designed to ensure that BIPI Sales and/or BIPI Marketing are not motivated to engage in improper Promotion, sales, and marketing of Covered Products.
- 5.11 BIPI's financial incentives shall not include mechanisms to provide incentive compensation for sales that may indicate Off-Label use of any Covered Product.

## Dissemination and Exchange of Medical Information

- 5.12 The content of BIPI's communications concerning Off-Label uses of a Covered Product shall not be false, misleading, or deceptive. BIPI shall not knowingly disseminate any Medical Information Response, including one that describes any Off-Label use of a Covered Product, unless such information and materials comply with the standards in applicable FDA regulations and with recommendations in FDA Guidances for Industry.
- 5.13 BIPI Sales and BIPI Marketing shall not develop Medical Information Responses regarding a Covered Product.
- 5.14 Medical Information Responses to Unsolicited Requests for Off-Label information regarding a Covered Product may be disseminated only by BIPI Medical, except in circumstances implicating public health or safety issues.
- 5.15 BIPI Medical shall have ultimate responsibility for developing and approving all Medical Information Responses regarding a Covered Product. Additional approvals may be provided by BIPI's legal department. BIPI shall not distribute any such materials unless:
  - (a) clinically relevant information is included in these materials to provide scientific balance;
  - (b) data in these materials are presented in an unbiased, non-Promotional manner; and

- (c) these materials are Clearly and Conspicuously distinguishable from sales aids and other Promotional Materials.
- 5.16 Nothing in this subsection shall prohibit BIPI Medical from disseminating materials that are permitted to be distributed under Federal law, Federal regulations, or FDA published Guidance, unless false, misleading, or deceptive.

## Responses to Unsolicited Requests for Off-Label Information

- 5.17 If BIPI elects to respond to an Unsolicited Request for Off-Label information regarding a Covered Product, BIPI Medical shall provide specific, accurate, objective, and scientifically balanced responses. Any such response shall not Promote a Covered Product for any Off-Label use.
- 5.18 Any written BIPI response to an Unsolicited Request for Off-Label information regarding a Covered Product shall be a Medical Information Response and shall include:
  - a copy of the FDA-required Labeling, if any, for the Covered Product (e.g., FDA-approved package insert and, if the response is for a consumer, FDA-approved patient Labeling);
  - (b) a prominent statement notifying the recipient that the FDA has not approved or cleared the Covered Product as safe and effective for the Off-Label use addressed in the accompanying materials;
  - (c) a prominent statement disclosing the uses for which FDA has approved or cleared the Covered Product; and
  - (d) a report containing the results of a reasonable literature search using terms from the request.

5.19 BIPI Sales and BIPI Marketing may respond orally to an Unsolicited Request for Off-Label information regarding a Covered Product only by offering to refer the request to BIPI Medical or by offering to put the HCP in touch with BIPI Medical.

## **Reprints Containing Off-Label Information**

- 5.20 BIPI shall not disseminate information describing any Off-Label or unapproved use of a Covered Product, unless such information and materials comply with the standards in applicable FDA regulations and with recommendations in FDA Guidances for Industry, including FDA's "Guidance for Industry: Responding to Unsolicited Requests for Off-Label Information About Prescription Drugs and Medical Devices" and FDA's "Guidance for Industry: Distributing Scientific and Medical Publications on Unapproved New Uses Recommended Practices," or as revised.
- 5.21 BIPI Medical shall be responsible for the identification, selection, approval and dissemination of Reprints Containing Off-Label Information regarding a Covered Product.
  - 5.22 Reprints Containing Off-Label Information regarding a Covered Product:
  - (a) shall be accompanied by the FDA approved Labeling for the Covered Product or a prominently displayed and Clearly and Conspicuously described hyperlink that will provide the reader with such information;
  - (b) shall contain a Clear and Conspicuous disclosure in a prominent location, which would include the first page or as a cover page where practicable, indicating that the article discusses Off-Label information; and
  - (c) shall not be referred to or used in a Promotional manner.
- 5.23 Reprints Containing Off-Label Information regarding a Covered Product may only be disseminated if approved by BIPI Medical to HCPs.

5.24 This section of the Order does not apply to reprints containing only incidental references to Off-Label information. If reprints have an incidental reference to Off-Label information, such reprints shall contain the disclosures required by Paragraph 5.22 (a) and Paragraph 5.22 (b) in a prominent location, as defined above, and such incidental reference to Off-Label information shall not be referred to or used in a Promotional manner as prohibited by Paragraph 5.22 (c).

#### 6. PAYMENT

amount of Thirteen Million Five Hundred Thousand Dollars (\$13,500,000) to be divided and paid by BIPI directly to each Signatory Attorney General of the Multistate Working Group in an amount to be designated by and in the sole discretion of the Multistate Executive Committee.<sup>3</sup> Said payment shall be used by the States as attorneys' fees and other costs of investigation and litigation, or to be placed in, or applied to, the consumer protection enforcement fund, including future consumer protection enforcement, consumer education, litigation or local consumer aid fund or revolving fund, used to defray the costs of the inquiry leading hereto, or any lawful purpose, at the sole discretion of each Signatory Attorney General. The parties acknowledge that the payment described herein is not a fine, penalty, or payment in lieu thereof.

## 7. RELEASE

7.1 By its execution of this Order, the State of Ohio releases BIPI and all of its past and present subsidiaries, predecessors, successors, assigns, parents, affiliates, each of their current and former officers, directors, shareholders, employees, agents, contractors, and attorneys (collectively, the Released Parties) from the following: all civil claims, *parens patriae* claims,

<sup>3</sup> The payment to the Ohio Attorney General shall be \$337,475.15.

causes of action, damages, restitution, fines, attorney's fees, costs, and penalties that the Ohio Attorney General has asserted or could have asserted against the Released Parties under the above-cited consumer protection statutes or any common law claims concerning unfair, fraudulent, or deceptive trade practices other than those described in Paragraph 7.2 resulting from the Covered Conduct up to and including the Effective Date.

- 7.2 Notwithstanding any term of this Order, specifically reserved and excluded from the release in Paragraph 7.1 as to any entity or person, including Released Parties, are any and all of the following:
  - (a) any criminal liability that any person and/or entity, including Released Parties,has or may have to the State of Ohio.
  - (b) any civil or administrative liability that any person and/or entity, including

    Released Parties, has or may have to the State of Ohio not expressly covered by

    the release in Paragraph 7.1 above, including, but not limited to, any and all of the
    following claims:
    - (i) state or federal antitrust violations;
    - (ii) claims involving "best price," "average wholesale price," "wholesale acquisition cost," or any price-reporting practices;
    - (iii) Medicaid claims, including, but not limited to, federal Medicaid drug rebate statute violations, Medicaid fraud or abuse, and/or kickback violations related to any State's Medicaid program;
    - (iv) state false claims violations; and

- (v) actions of state program payors of the State of Ohio arising from the purchase of a Covered Product, except for the release of civil penalties under the Ohio Consumer Sales Practices Act, R.C. 1345.01 et seq.
- (c) any claims individual consumers have or may have under the State of Ohio's above-cited consumer protection law, and any common law claims individual consumers may have concerning unfair, fraudulent or deceptive trade practices, against any person and/or entity, including Released Parties.

#### 8. DISPUTE RESOLUTION

8.1 For the purposes of resolving disputes with respect to compliance with this Order, should any of the Signatory Attorneys General have a reasonable basis to believe that BIPI has engaged in a practice that violates a provision of this Order subsequent to the Effective Date of this Judgment, then such Attorney General shall notify BIPI in writing of the specific objection, identify with particularity the provision of this Order that the practice appears to violate, and give BIPI 30 days to respond to the notification; provided, however, that a Signatory Attorney General may take any action if the Signatory Attorney General concludes that, because of the specific practice, a threat to the health or safety of the public requires immediate action. Upon receipt of written notice, BIPI shall provide a good-faith written response to the Attorney General notification, containing either a statement explaining why BIPI believes it is in compliance with the Order, or a detailed explanation of how the alleged violation occurred and a statement explaining how BIPI intends to remedy the alleged breach. Nothing in this section shall be interpreted to limit the state's Civil Investigative Demand ("CID") or investigative subpoena authority, to the extent such authority exists under applicable law, and BIPI reserves all of its rights in responding to a CID or investigative subpoena issued pursuant to such authority.

- 8.2 Upon giving BIPI 30 days to respond to the notification described above, the Signatory Attorney General shall also be permitted reasonable access to inspect and copy relevant, non-privileged, non-work product records and documents in the possession, custody, or control of BIPI that relate to BIPI's compliance with each provision of this Order pursuant to that State's CID or investigative subpoena authority. If the Signatory Attorney General makes or requests copies of any documents during the course of that inspection, the Signatory Attorney General will provide a list of those documents to BIPI.
- 8.3 The Signatory Attorney General may assert any claim that BIPI has violated this Order in a separate civil action to enforce compliance with this Order, or may seek any other relief afforded by law, but only after providing BIPI an opportunity to respond to the notification described in Paragraph 8.1 above; provided, however, that the Signatory Attorney General may take any action if the Signatory Attorney General concludes that, because of the specific practice, a threat to the health or safety of the public requires immediate action.

#### 9. GENERAL PROVISIONS

- 9.1 BIPI shall not cause third parties, acting on its behalf, to engage in practices from which BIPI is prohibited by this Order.
- 9.2 This Order does not constitute an approval by any of the Signatory Attorneys General of BIPI's business practices, and BIPI shall make no representation or claim to the contrary.
- 9.3 Any failure by any party to this Order to insist upon the strict performance by any other party of any of the provisions of this Order shall not be deemed a waiver of any of the provisions of this Order, and such party, notwithstanding such failure, shall have the right thereafter to insist upon the specific performance of any and all of the provisions of this Order. This Order represents the full and complete terms of the settlement entered into by the parties

hereto. In any action undertaken by the parties, no prior versions of this Order and no prior

versions of any of its terms that were not entered by the Court in this Order, may be introduced for

any purpose whatsoever.

9.4 This Court retains jurisdiction of this Order and the parties hereto for the purpose

of enforcing and modifying this Order and for the purpose of granting such additional relief as

may be necessary and appropriate.

9.5 This Order may be executed in counterparts, and a facsimile or .pdf signature

shall be deemed to be, and shall have the same force and effect as, an original signature.

9.6 To the extent that any provision of this Order obligates BIPI to change any

policy(ies) or procedure(s) and to the extent not already accomplished, BIPI shall implement the

policy(ies) or procedure(s) as soon as reasonably practicable, but no later than 90 days after the

Effective Date of this Order.

9.7 The parties agree that neither of them shall be deemed the drafter of this Order

and that, in construing this Order, no provision hereof shall be construed in favor of one party on

the ground that such provision was drafted by the other.

9.8 All notices under this Order shall be provided to the following via email and

Overnight Mail:

For the State of Ohio:

Tracy Morrison Dickens

**Assistant Attorney General** 

**Consumer Protection Section** 

30 E. Broad St., 14th Floor

Columbus, Ohio 43215

tracy.dickens@ohioattorneygeneral.gov

# Franklin County Ohio Clerk of Courts of the Common Pleas- 2017 Dec 22 10:00 AM-17CV011207

For Boehringer Ingelheim Pharmaceuticals, Inc.:

Wick Sollers King & Spalding LLP 1700 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W. Washington, DC 20006 wsollers@kslaw.com

IT IS SO ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED.

# JOINTLY APPROVED AND SUBMITTED FOR ENTRY

# PLAINTIFF, STATE OF OHIO

Michael DeWine Attorney General of Ohio

By: /s/ Tracy Morrison Dickens

Tracy Morrison Dickens (0082898)
Michael S. Ziegler (0042206)
Assistant Attorneys General
Attorney for Plaintiff State of Ohio
Office of the Ohio Attorney General
Consumer Protection Section
30 E. Broad St., 14th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215
(614) 466-3999
tracy.dickens@ohioattorneygeneral.gov
(866) 449-0989 (facsimile)

Date: December 21, 2017

#### **DEFENDANT**

# Boehringer Ingelheim Pharmaceuticals, Inc.

By: /s/ Christian Orth, per written authorization, by Tracy Morrison Dickens

Christian Orth Senior Vice President and Chief Financial Officer Boehringer Ingelheim Pharmaceuticals, Inc.

Date: December 12, 2017

#### **DEFENDANT**

Boehringer Ingelheim Pharmaceuticals, Inc.

By: /s/ Danielle M. Brim, per written authorization, by Tracy Morrison Dickens

Danielle M. Brim, Esq. (0079670) King & Spalding LLP 1700 Pennsylvania Avenue NW, Suite 200 Washington, D.C. 20006 (202) 626-2957 dbrim@kslaw.com

and

J. Sedwick Sollers, III, Esq.
Mark Jensen, Esq.
Brandt A. Leibe, Esq.
Daniel C. Sale, Esq.
King & Spalding LLP
1700 Pennsylvania Avenue NW, Suite 200
Washington, D.C. 20006

Counsel for Defendant

Date: December 19, 2017

\*\*\* Pursuant to the Court's Sixth Amended Administrative Order issued May 6, 2015, the party submitting a proposed order/entry shall, after the order/entry has been signed by the Judge and e-Filed, print out a copy of the same and mail it to all non-registered parties on the case. \*\*\*

# Franklin County Court of Common Pleas

**Date:** 12-22-2017

Case Title: OHIO STATE ATTORNEY GENERAL -VS- BOEHRINGER

INGELHEIM PHARMACEUTICALS INC

**Case Number:** 17CV011207

Type: CONSENT JUDGMENT

It Is So Ordered.

/s/ Judge Guy L. Reece, II

Electronically signed on 2017-Dec-22 page 20 of 20